



Approved

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
5:30 p.m.
Thursday, December 17, 2009
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Michael Knight; Commissioners David Klavitter, Chris Olson, John Whalen, Mary Loney Bichell, Joseph Rapp, Chris Wand, Peggy Stover and Bob McDonell.

Commissioners Excused: None.

Staff Members Present: Laura Carstens and David Johnson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Knight at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: The minutes of the November 19, 2009 meeting were reviewed.

Motion by Olson, seconded by Wand, to approve the minutes of the November 19, 2009 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Loney Bichell, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Tim & Melissa McGinnis / Ron & Tina Malone for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the front porch, siding, windows, trim, and soffits and infill a door and window opening located at 959 Spruce Street in the W. 11th Street Historic Preservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report. He explained the elements of the proposal, and noted the materials.

Tim McGinnis, 8244 Hidden Valley Drive, and Ron Malone, 1597 Manson Road, were present.

Commissioner Rapp arrived at 5:35 p.m.

Commissioners discussed the Architectural Guidelines and their concerns about the appearance of the proposed split face block to enclose the porch and infill the window on the south side of the building. Commissioners stated the window should remain.

Commissioners discussed the porch proposal. The applicants noted the porch is shifting and they want to stabilize it. Commissioners discussed using stone versus cement block. The applicants noted the desire to infill below the porch is to provide more storage. Commissioners felt outdoor equipment could be stored with the porch being reconstructed similar in appearance to the existing porch with lattice. Commissioners felt that closing in the porch would significantly affect the building's appearance.

Commissioners discussed the proposed siding, soffit and fascia. They noted the project will be the first significant structure to use LP Building Products SmartSide materials. Commissioners felt this would be a good test case for the LP SmartSiding for the trim and soffit. The Commission supported the use of smooth cement board siding with a four inch lap width.

Commissioners discussed construction options for the lattice work. The applicants asked if they could put plywood painted black behind the lattice. Commissioners supported the use of plywood painted a dark color behind the lattice. The Commission suggested using water resistant materials.

Commissioners asked about the windows. Staff explained the Commission's window policy and noted the applicant can replace windows with vinyl or aluminum clad provided they are the same style, size and shape as the original window. Staff noted if the applicant uses Lead Abatement Funds to replace the windows, State standards may require wood windows. Staff stated the City will work with the applicants on the window requirements as Lead Abatement Funds are used.

Commissioners discussed the proposed door infill on the south side of the building. The Commission stated the design guidelines would not allow the door opening to be infilled. The Commission stated the door should remain and it can be cleaned and repainted.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Bichell, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. Railing design be reviewed by staff to match HPC standard.
2. Lower area under porch to be wood frame or wood-covered to support the porch as it is now, with footings of concrete or concrete block, or use the existing foundation.
3. Spaces between porch supports to replicate vertical/horizontal lattice. Dark colored painted wood is allowed behind the lattice.
4. Windows can be replaced as per the application, provided they are the same size, style and shape, with materials dependent on the source of funds.
5. Two windows proposed for infill to remain as windows. A dark-painted material can be placed behind the windows to retain the appearance of an opening.

6. Door proposed for infill to remain as a door. The door can be cleaned and painted with a dark colored painted material behind it to retain the appearance of an opening.

Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Loney Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

DESIGN REVIEW: Application of Jim Krueger / Auto & Truck Parts Inc. for a Certificate of Appropriateness / Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Fund to replace roof located at 3000 Jackson Street in the Brewery Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staff Member Johnson reviewed the staff report, noting the building's significance, proposed improvements, two bids, loan request, and enforcement.

Jim Krueger, Auto and Truck Parks, Inc., reviewed why the work needed to be done and what is proposed. He clarified what portion of the roof will be replaced.

Commissioners discussed roof pitch and ridge height. Staff clarified the ridge will be about six feet. The applicant reviewed the roof profile with the Commission. The Commission stated the pitch of the roof should not cause the roof to exceed the parapet height and be visible from the street. The applicant acknowledged that would not happen.

Commissioners asked about the bids. Concerns were raised about the validity of the bids. Staff noted the bids are to establish the loan amount, but the applicant does not have to use either bid. Staff also clarified the loan program is on a reimbursement basis.

Motion by Wand, seconded by Whalen, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness and up to \$11,500 in Historic Preservation Revolving Loan Funds as submitted with the provision that the new roof cannot extend above the parapet. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Loney Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: Commissioners discussed taking photos periodically to document the cement siding and LP SmartSiding on 959 Spruce Street.

Commissioners discussed the process for creating new local historic districts, and areas that might be considered in the Downtown Conservation District.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:

Historic Preservation Ordinance: Staff explained the materials are being forwarded for the Commission's information.

Enforcement Report Update: Commissioner Bichell asked if a porch on a brownstone in the 1500 block of Bluff is plastic or painted, and asked staff to investigate.

Commissioner Wand asked staff to verify that the entrance at 110 E. 9th Street in the Historic Millwork District meets the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion by Whalen, seconded by Wand, to direct staff to investigate these two properties. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Klavitter, Olson, Whalen, Knight, Loney Bichell, Rapp, Wand, Stover and McDonell; Nay – None.

ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 6:44 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Laura Carstens, Planning Services Manager

Adopted—January 14, 2010