

MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION
5:30 p.m.
Thursday, June 20, 2019
City Council Chamber, Historic Federal Building

Commissioners Present: Chairperson Emily Hilgendorf, Commissioners Brandi Clark, Melissa Daykin-Cassill, Christina Monk, Al Kopczyk, Rick Stuter, and Joseph Rapp.

Commissioners Excused: John McAndrews, David Klavitter

Commissioners Unexcused: none

Staff Members Present: Chris Happ Olson and Travis Schrobilgen.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Hilgendorf at 5:30 p.m.

AFFIDAVIT OF COMPLIANCE: Staff presented an Affidavit of Compliance verifying the meeting was being held in compliance with the Iowa Open Meetings Law.

MINUTES: Motion by Monk, seconded by Stuter, to approve the minutes of the May 16, 2019 meeting as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote 7-0: Aye – Rapp, Clark, Daykin-Cassill, Kopczyk, Monk, Stuter and Hilgendorf; Nay – None.

Design Review: Application of John & Kristen Eby, 175 Alpine, to install 13 solar panels on south roof and gable in the Langworthy Historic District.

Staff Member Schrobilgen detailed the staff report noting the applicant is requesting to install 13 solar panels on the south and cross-gable of the residence. He also discussed the dwelling's building style, it being within the Langworthy National Historic District and its level of significance through the years. He referred to the applicable Architectural Guidelines, those being Integrating Energy Generating Technologies on Historic Buildings and Solar Collectors. Staff Member Schrobilgen concluded the staff report by summarizing the role of the Commission and ability of the applicant to appeal a decision.

Staff Member Olson informed the Commission that the contractor called just prior to the meeting and discussed the layout of the proposed panels. She reported that there is potential to adjust them away from the ridgeline, but they are limited by space when

adjusting panels away from the front façade. The only means possible for moving them further back would be to eliminate one panel.

Kristen Eby, 175 Alpine, describe her request noting alternative energy sources are good for the environment.

The Commission requested clarification from the applicant on whether a garage was available. The applicant noted she had a garage and that it was not available since they would have to cut down a large tree in order provide enough sun for the solar array. The Commission discussed optimal placement and ways to minimize affect on historic character, including pulling back from the top ridgeline and the front of the house.

Motion by Monk, seconded by Daykin-Cassill, to approve the application as submitted with the following conditions: that the top line of the array be at least 8” away/down from the ridgelines, and that panels on the array closest to Alpine Street be pulled back as much as possible, with a minimum of 12”. Motion carried by the following vote 7-0: Aye – Rapp, Kopczyk, Daykin-Cassill, Clark, Monk, Stuter and Hilgendorf; Nay – None.

Design Review: Application of Dallas Kalmes, 1038 Bluff, to demolish a 2-story porch and replace with a front deck in the Jackson Street Historic District.

Staff Member Olson reviewed the staff report, noting the application is to demolish a two-story porch and replace it with a ground first story deck with metal handrails. She discussed the historical background, style, layout, and significance of the structure. She noted Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps from 1909 depict a first story, framed, open porch concluding that the second story porch was not likely original. She also noted poor property maintenance has deteriorated the porch. She pointed out that it was recently purchased by the applicant, the structure has been cited by the Building Services Department to address these concerns, and that the applicant is working toward a solution. Additionally, she described her communications and efforts to work with the applicant.

Ms. Olson also informed the Commission of potential “ghosts” which may reveal the historic architecture of the structure, if the original porch is removed, that being areas of discoloring due to inconsistent weathering or revealed connections to the structure. She also noted that demolition would reveal a second story door opening and window that are currently inside the second story enclosed porch.

Ms. Olson referred to page 55 and page 56 of the Architectural Guidelines and noted the potential options available to the applicant to meet both his needs and comply with the Architectural Guidelines.

Commissioners discussed the existing porch and asked for clarification on whether the porch was original, whether it was ground level, and whether it had a roof. Staff Member Olson stated that the drawing and key from the 1909 and 1950 Sanborn Fire Insurance

Maps clearly show that a one-story, open covered porch would have been in place in the early 20th Century. She referred to the staff report that shows that the second story addition was added sometime between the finalization of the 1950 Sanborn Map and the Architectural Survey by Bruce Kriviskey in 1978-79, when the enclosed second story porch is documented.

Ms. Olson informed the Commission that Mr. Kalmes had indicated he would bring the infill brick and the replacement window (or its specifications) to the Commission for review at the meeting for consideration. Mr. Kalmes did not have those samples or specifications, but did show the composite decking material requested to the Commission.

Mr. Kalmes expressed a desire to expand the footprint of the deck, but was unable to provide a floor plan or request with an exact size. This request contradicted the application by Mr. Kalmes, where the proposed structure was to fit on the existing footprint. Ms. Olson referred to the applicant's and Planning Staff Members' conversation about what was necessary to make that request, and that the Commission didn't have enough information to be able to approve an expansion. She indicated the section of the staff report where Mr. Kalmes was informed about what was necessary in order to expand the footprint of the deck.

The Commissioners asked Mr. Kalmes many questions about options to make the structure more historically appropriate, including adding a roof and columns to make it a porch. The Commission discussed the possibility of Mr. Kalmes coming back to the next meeting, in order to bring back appropriate plans for work. Mr. Kalmes was unwilling to compromise on his application or table the project.

Motion by Kopczyk, second by Monk, to approve the application as submitted, with the following conditions: that Mr. Kalmes work with Ms. Olson to find a suitable replacement salvage brick and that the handrail system be made of wood instead of metal, at the same size and bulk of the metal railing specifications. Motion carried by the following vote 5-2: Aye: Stuter, Rapp, Kopczyk, Clark, and Daykin-Cassill; Nay – Monk and Hilgendorf.

Demolition Permit: Application of Travis or Julie McDermott/ JTM Properties LLC, to demolish the front 30 feet of 1043 Main Street in the Jackson Park Neighborhood Conservation District/Upper Main Street National Register Historic District.

Staff Member Olson reviewed the staff report and request, noting that the structure is considered non-contributing in multiple surveys of the area, and within the Upper Main Street National Register Historic District. She noted that the request was only for 1043 Main St., and did not include its neighbor at 1053 Main. Ms. Olson reviewed the Commission's role in review, in that they only consider demolition requests within the Conservation Districts.

Commissioner Daykin-Cassill noted a conflict of interest due to having a contract with the applicant, abstained from discussion or voting and excused herself from the room at 7:01 p.m.

The applicant Travis McDermott, of 12146 Whispering Meadows Drive, spoke about his project and desire to remove the first 33 feet of the structure. He noted the roof was caving in and the support beams were failing. He stated it was too expensive to rehabilitate.

Discussion about the request and structure followed. Commissioner Monk asked the applicant how the structure would be removed, and whether it is tied into adjacent structures. Mr. McDermott stated that they will essentially have to deconstruct the building by hand because of the concern and proximity of neighboring buildings, and that he was aware and watching for any issues that might arise. Discussion continued with a suggestion to salvage the Vitrolite-like panels if possible, to which Mr. McDermott agreed.

Motion by Monk, second by Kopczyk, to approve the application as submitted. Motion carried by the following vote 6-0-1: Aye – Stuter, Rapp, Kopczyk, Monk, Hilgendorf, Clark and Daykin-Cassill; Nay – None; Abstain – Daykin-Cassill.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: None

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: Chairperson Emily Hilgendorf provided a handout to Commissioners and Staff Members on the Preservation Fair planning. She invited Bill Doyle, present in the audience and a representative from Heritage Works that serves on the Preservation Fair Planning Committee, to participate. Mr. Doyle participated in discussion.

Ms. Hilgendorf provided an explanation of the changed format from event at the library, to combining forces with Heritage Works to create a weekend of events. Mr. Doyle explained that Heritage Works has garnered funding to produce two different Wood Window Restoration Workshops: a 4-hour class on Friday, September 6, 2019 and a 2-day intensive workshop on Saturday and Sunday, September 7 & 8, 2019. Mr. Doyle and Ms. Hilgendorf explained that a shift was made to make all events of the fair and workshops free, with the 2-day being a targeted audience to meet goals of Heritage Works. Ms. Hilgendorf said she would contact the library to cancel the space use for the fair, after Mr. Doyle confirmed that Steeple Square would house the fair at no cost. Discussions about the layout of the event, marketing, exhibit hall and tracking of RSVPs followed.

ITEMS FROM STAFF: Staff Member Olson noted the thank you letter in the packet for free admission to Eagle Point Park during Preservation Month, from a Galena teacher and her class. The Commission was pleased to have offered the opportunity to the community.

Ms. Olson noted that the Loras College National Register Historic District Nomination has been reviewed by the State Nominations Review Committee on June 14, 2019 and other than some minor changes, the nomination was recommended and is being finalized and sent to the National Park Service. She referenced the memo from Planning Services Manager Laura Carstens.

Ms. Olson noted the letter from Certified Local Government Coordinator Paula Mohr and the positive response from the state for the Eagle Point Park Dubuque Landmark Site Nomination. She stated the City Council will review the nomination on July 1, 2019 and requested that if any Commissioners were available to attend and thank the City Council at the meeting, it would be appreciated.

Ms. Olson provided an overview of the Four Mounds Summit from May 22-23, 2019 and stated that as a result of the summit, another one is upcoming on July 19, 2019, as a means to include those tribal nations and experts that weren't available the first time to come and provide input. She described the process and the deviation from previous approaches to working with tribal nations. Chairperson Hilgendorf offered to represent the Commission at the upcoming Mini-Summit.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Monk, seconded by Clark, to adjourn the June 20, 2019 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote 7-0: Aye – Rapp, Clark, Daykin-Cassill, Kopczyk, Monk, Stuter and Hilgendorf; Nay – None.

The meeting adjourned at 8:01 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Chris Happ Olson, Assistant Planner

September 25, 2019

Adopted