

**MINUTES
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR SESSION**

5:30 p.m.

Thursday, May 21, 2020

Virtual Meeting

Commissioners Present: All Commission members were present virtually via webviewer in GoToMeeting. Vice Chairperson Brandi Clark, Commissioners Melissa Daykin Cassill, Christina Monk, David Klavitter, Joseph Rapp, and Bill Doyle.

Commissioners Excused: Rick Stuter, John McAndrews & Craig Reber

Commissioners Unexcused: None.

Staff Members Present: Wally Wernimont and Chris Happ Olson.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson Clark at 5:36 p.m. Staffmember Chris Happ Olson announced that due to the COVID-19 pandemic and mandates for social distancing, the meeting was conducted entirely virtually.

MINUTES: Motion by Monk, seconded by Daykin-Cassil, to approve the minutes of the March 19, 2020 meeting as submitted. Motion carried 6-0 by the following vote: Aye – Daykin Cassill, Monk, Klavitter, Rapp, Doyle and Clark; Nay – none.

ACTION ITEMS:

Demolition Review

Application of the City of Dubuque Housing and Community Development Department to demolish structure at 1448 Jackson Street, Washington Neighborhood National Register Historic District; and Washington Neighborhood Conservation District.

Staffmember Olson presented the staff report. She referred to the location of the building in respects to the Washington Neighborhood Conservation District and being a contributing building within the Washington Neighborhood National Register Historic District. She described the building structure, noting multiple layers of exterior cladding material and additions. She referred to the age of additions and Sanborn fire insurance maps. Olson asked the applicant to provide more information about the request and project:

Housing Inspector Shane Hoeper, representing the applicant, explained to the City's enforcement history with the property. He noted broken windows and siding issues. He said the property was sold to Dubuque's True North and the City acquired the property after the dissolution of that project. He said he has been tasked with the rehabilitation

of the structure. He referred to photos of the structure noting ongoing insect damage, mold and moisture programs, based on the Housing and Community Development Department's evaluation of the building. He said they are proposing to demolish the structure and rebuild a new structure.

Olson referred to the staff report, noting the history of the property and architectural surveys. She said that structure was not identified as NRHP eligible from the 1979 Kriviskey survey. She noted that Jim Jacobsen identified the structure as a contributing structure to a NR historic district. She explained the role of the Commission with reviewing demolition permits, describing the two-step process in which the Commission may evaluate a claim of Economic Non-Viability.

Commissioner Rapp asked if the building is demolished, would the new building be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Commission. Olson noted the property is in a Conservation District for demolition review only and that the role of the Commission is to review the demolition request and the request for the certificate of Economic Non-Viability, should the first be denied.

Commissioner Doyle asked if the Washington Neighborhood is listed. Olson referred to the staff analysis in the staff report which refers to its listing on the National Register of Historic Places. He noted that if the building is identified to be a contributing building to a NRHP district, then it is architectural and/or historically significant.

Motion by Klavitter, seconded by Commissioner Monk, to approve the demolition permit application as presented based on architectural/historical significance. Motion failed 0 -6 by the following vote: Aye – None, Nay – Daykin Cassill, Monk, Klavitter, Rapp, Doyle and Clark.

The Commission reviewed the application based on economic feasibility. Hoepfer referred to the rehabilitation documents for the property. He noted True North's purchase price of \$20,000 and the cost to rehabilitate at about \$196,000. He noted that it is not habitable.

Commissioner Klavitter asked Hoepfer if the cost to rehab this building is the same cost to build this house. Hoepfer said it would be the same to rehab the building and to build new. He said they would have to take the structure to the foundation because of the moisture and insect damage. Commissioner Klavitter asked if they have investigated incentives for the property. Hoepfer said the city is not eligible for historic tax credits. He said the building is not habitable and they are working day to day to inspect homes to prevent demolition by neglect.

Commissioner Klavitter said he would like more information for him to make a determination of Economic Non-Viability. He asked about houses that the City took over for True North. Hoepfer said they have buildings they are rehabilitating. He said this building is the worst condition of the buildings they acquired. Olson noted the

Commission reviewed and approved a demolition for True North at their February 2020 meeting.

Commission Rapp asked about the foundation. Hoepfer said the joists and sill plates are deteriorated and the rear half of the house is not on a full foundation. He said they would have to take the building down to the limestone foundation to rebuild.

Commissioner Monk asked Hoepfer if they could receive an updated quote with the structure repairs. He said the estimate they have does not include those structure modifications to address the structural damage. Hoepfer noted that the Gronen estimate did not include the structural damage. He said that would add about \$20,000 to the estimate.

Commissioner Doyle ask about the possibility of demolishing the rear addition. Hoepfer noted they did not look into removing just the rear addition.

Commissioner Doyle asked about roof pitch. Staffperson Olson explained that the roof has been modified, with eaves cutoff. Further discussion followed regarding the rear addition and egress stairs, as well as interior stairs.

Staffperson Olson referred to the Role of the Commission to review the application for Certificate of Economic Non-Viability.

Commissioner Klavitter expressed he would be interested in seeing the cost of the structural repairs to the building. He said if he had the information, he could have a better decision. Commissioner Monk would like to see the numbers updated with the structure improvements. Hoepfer, noted the numbers would only get worse. He said it would add about \$20,000. He said they would be looking at a \$100,000 lost.

Commissioner Doyle asked what is left with historic interior finishes. Hoepfer said there is nothing remaining other than the front door and floor plan. He said his intention is to build a new building and make it more historically accurate.

Staffperson Olson noted if this were rehabilitated, the Commission would look at the exterior only. She said that as you peel back the layers, you will expose more of the historic fabric. She said the eaves have been removed, front porch is modified, and the windows have been removed.

Further discussion regarding a new rehabilitation cost, with updated structural numbers. The consensus was that the economic situation would be worse. Staffperson Olson discussed the Commission's ability to include information gleaned from the application process and the discussion at the meeting into the motion.

Commissioner Klavitter asked that the city look at available incentives in future projects. He also hoped that whatever would be built in its place should fit in the neighborhood

based on good design. Commissioner Doyle agreed with Commissioner Klavitter. He said a contemporary building could fit well and not replicate the historic building.

Motion by Monk, seconded by Rapp, to approve the application based on Economic Non-Viability with the understanding:

- 1) The building lacks architectural integrity (i.e. loss of porch, materials, eaves, etc.);
- 2) The fact that financial incentives are not available; and
- 3) The structural rehabilitation is not reflected in the rehabilitation estimate.

Motion carried 6-0 by the following vote: Aye – Daykin Cassill, Monk, Klavitter, Rapp, Doyle and Clark; Nay – none.

ITEMS FROM PUBLIC: No items from the public

ITEMS FROM COMMISSION: The Commission welcomed Commissioner Doyle to the Commission.

ITEMS FROM STAFF:
Preservation Updates

Preserve Iowa Summit: Staffmember Olson reported the Preservation Iowa Summit has been changed to a virtual conference. She noted the Commissioner have free admission to the conference. She noted there are APA and AIA CE credits available for the conference.

ADJOURNMENT: Motion by Monk, seconded by Rapp to adjourn the May 21, 2020 Commission meeting. Motion carried by the following vote: Aye – Daykin Cassill, Monk, Klavitter, Rapp, Doyle and Clark; Nay – none.

The meeting adjourned at 7:03 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Wally Wernimont, Planning Services Manager

06-18-2020

Adopted